

MINUTES OF MEETING:

Newton Historical Commission

DATE:

October 23, 2008

PLACE/TIME:

**Newton City Hall - Room 202
7:00 P.M.**

IN ATTENDANCE:

**David Morton, Acting Chair
Nancy Grissom, Member
Rodney Barker, Member
William Roesner, Member
Alfred Wojciechowski, Member
Zack Blake, Alternate Member
Brian Lever – Staff
See attendance sheet**

The meeting was called to order with David Morton presiding as Acting Chairman. Voting permanent members included Wojciechowski, Grissom, Barker, Roesner, and Morton. Alternate member Blake also voted. Brian Lever acted as recording secretary. The meeting was called to order at 7:00pm and was taped on 1 tape.

1 118 Parker Street – Waiver of Delay

David Torrey and Walter Beebe-Center presented plans for additions to the north façade, rear façade, and front façade. The addition to the north façade consisted of a new gable end, the front façade addition included a new one-story filled in wrap around porch. A one-story addition was proposed for the rear and a widow's walk for the roof. Commission members expressed concern over the porch addition wrapping around the façade in a continuous plane. Roesner suggested breaking up the addition on the north façade with a set back and as a condition of granting a waiver of delay. Wojciechowski motioned to approve the plans with the condition Roesner seconded this motion which failed to pass. Grissom moved to approve the plans as submitted with a suggestion of a setback, Barker seconded, this motion passed.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on October 23, 2008 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 2-4,

RESOLVED to waive the demolition delay on 118 Parker Street based upon the plans as submitted with the following condition: that the north façade one story porch addition not be a continuous wall plane and have a minimum of a one foot set back at the intersection of the proposed porch and dining room with final approval to be given by commission staff.

Voting in the Affirmative:

**William Roesner, Member
Alfred Wojciechowski, Member**

Voting in the Negative:

**David Morton, Member
Nancy Grissom, Member
Rodney Barker, Member
Zack Blake, Alternate Member**

Motion failed to pass.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on October 23, 2008 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-2,

RESOLVED to waive the demolition delay on 118 Parker Street based upon the plans as submitted with the following suggestion: that the north façade one story porch addition not be a continuous wall plane and have a minimum of a one foot set back at the intersection of the proposed porch and dining room.

Voting in the Affirmative:

David Morton, Member
Nancy Grissom, Member
Rodney Barker, Member
Zack Blake, Alternate Member

Voting in the Negative:

William Roesner, Member
Alfred Wojciechowski, Member

2 34 Frances Street – Demolition Review Full Demolition

Stephanie Elh and Mark Gilroy presented an application to demolish the home at 34 Frances Street. Staff stated that the home was one of a series built in that neighborhood during the 1950's. Elh stated that the home had been on the market for some time and that no buyers had come forth for the home due to its condition. Grissom moved to find the home not preferably preserved and Blake seconded, the motion failed to carry a majority. Barker then moved to find the home preferably preserved, Wojciechowski seconded. This motion failed to pass and as a majority was not available to initiate the demolition delay the home was found not preferably preserved.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on October 23, 2008 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 3-3,

RESOLVED to find the house and garage at 34 Frances Street preferably preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

William Roesner, Member
Alfred Wojciechowski, Member
Rodney Barker, Member

Voting in the Negative:

David Morton, Member
Nancy Grissom, Member
Zack Blake, Alternate Member

Motion failed to pass.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on October 23, 2008 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 3-3,

RESOLVED to find the house and garage at 34 Frances Street not preferably preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

David Morton, Member
Nancy Grissom, Member
Zack Blake, Alternate Member

Voting in the Negative:

William Roesner, Member
Alfred Wojciechowski, Member
Rodney Barker, Member

Motion failed to pass. Home found not preferably preserved due to lack of majority needed to initiate delay.

3 121 Avalon Street – Demolition Review Full Demolition

Property owners Joan Laxson and Ilkka Suvanto presented an application to demolish their home. The applicants cited the age of the home and market concerns. Staff informed the commission of the home's location adjacent to a National Register district and it being of the same style of some of the home's located in that district as a 1910 Colonial Revival. Grissom moved to find the home preferably preserved and Barker seconded.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on October 23, 2008 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0,

RESOLVED to find the house and garage at 121 Avalon Street preferably preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

David Morton, Member

Nancy Grissom, Member

Zack Blake, Alternate Member

William Roesner, Member

Alfred Wojciechowski, Member

Rodney Barker, Member

4 170 Oliver Road– Demolition Review Partial Demolition

Property owner Stephanie Meilman and architect Mollie Blunder Moran presented an application to demolish portions of the front façade and add a rear addition. Staff stated that this home was one of many Colonial Revivals built during the 1920's in this neighborhood and that some of the buildings were documented however this one was not, likely skipped and deemed insignificant. Barker moved to find the home preferably preserved, the motion was not seconded and failed. Blake moved to find the home not preferably preserved and Grissom seconded.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on October 23, 2008 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-1,

RESOLVED to find the house and garage at 170 Oliver Road not preferably preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

David Morton, Member

William Roesner, Member

Nancy Grissom, Member

Alfred Wojciechowski, Member

Zack Blake, Alternate Member

Voting in the Negative:

Rodney Barker, Member

5 371 Lowell Avenue– Demolition Review Full Demolition

Property owner David Smyly presented an application to demolish the home and replace it with a multi-family dwelling. Commission member Roesner recused himself from the hearing as he is an associate of Smyly's. Staff informed the commission that no historic documentation exists for this property, but given the set back from the street and tree growth, it was likely overlooked. Limited research suggests that this home and adjacent home 448 Highland Street are the oldest homes in the immediate vicinity and were likely worker housing for a nearby leather factory owned by William Claflin former Governor of Massachusetts whose home still exists in Newton. Barker suggested that it could be kept as a studio or secondary cottage on the property. Barker moved to find the building preferably preserved and Wojciechowski seconded. Smyly presented the plans for the proposed building, but the commission decline to offer a waiver of delay.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on October 23, 2008 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0,

RESOLVED to find the house and at 371 Lowell Avenue preferably preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

David Morton, Member

Rodney Barker, Member

Recused from Vote:

William Roesner, Member

Nancy Grissom, Member
Alfred Wojciechowski, Member
Zack Blake, Alternate Member

6 21 Coyne Road– Demolition Review Full Demolition

Property owner David Smyly presented an application to demolish the home. Abutter Michael Lepie expressed concern over the massing of a replacement home and the potential traffic and parking generated by a new home. Grissom moved to find the home not preferably preserved, and the motion failed due to no second. Barker moved to find the home preferably preserved, and Wojciechowski seconded.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on October 23, 2008 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0,

RESOLVED to find the house at 21 Coyne Road preferably preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:
Alfred Wojciechowski, Member
Rodney Barker, Member

Voting in the Negative:
David Morton, Member
Zack Blake, Alternate Member
Nancy Grissom, Member

Recused from Vote:
William Roesner, Member

Motion fails, home found not preferably preserved.

7 28 Pennsylvania Avenue– Demolition Review Partial Demolition

Property owners Susan Korsmeyer and Leonard Davenport presented and application to build a rear addition to their home. Commission members noted the extensive work done restoring the original home. Commission members expressed concern over the design of the proposed addition. Proposed materials included cedar shingles and architectural roof shingles as well as stone exterior. Grissom moved to find the home preferably preserved and Roesner seconded.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on October 23, 2008 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0,

RESOLVED to find the house and at 28 Pennsylvania Avenue preferably preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:
Alfred Wojciechowski, Member
Rodney Barker, Member
Nancy Grissom, Member

David Morton, Member
Zack Blake, Alternate Member
William Roesner, Member

FURTHER RESOLVED by vote of 5-1, to waive the demolition delay at 28 Pennsylvania Avenue based upon the plans submitted at the meeting with the following conditions: that the plans be corrected to accurately show the proposed addition and that the new construction drawings submitted contain materials specifications.

Voting in the Affirmative:
Alfred Wojciechowski, Member
David Morton, Member
Rodney Barker, Member
Zack Blake, Alternate Member

Voting in the Negative:
William Roesner, Member

Nancy Grissom, Member

8 Administrative Discussion

A Approval of September Minutes.

The commission approved the September minutes 4-0 with Alfred Wojciechowski and Rodney Barker abstaining from vote.

Meeting adjourned 9:25 PM. Minutes approved at 11/18/08 meeting.

Recorded by Brian Lever, Commission Staff